



COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA
ENVIRONMENTAL HEARING BOARD



ANDREW AND RACHAEL DYMSKI and
STANLEY AND JODY SHIVELL

v.

COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA,
DEPARTMENT OF ENVIRONMENTAL
PROTECTION and CUMBERLAND
COUNTY CONSERVATION DISTRICT
and CARLISLE DEVELOPMENT
PARTNERS, LLC, Permittee

:
:
:
:
:
:
:
:
:
:
:

EHB Docket No. 2026-095-CS

PRE-HEARING ORDER NO. 1

IT IS HEREBY ORDERED as follows:

SCHEDULING DISCOVERY AND FILING OF DISPOSITIVE MOTIONS

1. The above matter has been assigned to **The Honorable Sarah L. Clark** for primary handling.
2. The **Board's Rules** are published at Chapter 1021 of Title 25 of the Pennsylvania Code, 25 Pa. Code §§ 1021.1 – 1021.201, and are available on the Board's website at [Rules of Practice and Procedure](#). Failure to adhere to the Board's Rules may result in the imposition of sanctions, including but not limited to dismissal of an appeal.
3. ***Amendment of Appeal*** - An appellant may amend its appeal as of right within **20** days of the date the appeal was filed and docketed by filing an amended notice of appeal with the Board. Thereafter, any appellant desiring to amend an appeal must do so by filing a motion for leave to amend, setting forth the basis for the request pursuant to 25 Pa. Code § 1021.53. A motion to amend need not be accompanied by a memorandum of law pursuant to 25 Pa. Code § 1021.95(d) if it is consented to by all parties, but it must be verified and supported by affidavits.
4. ***Confer as to Settlement*** - Within **45** days of the date of this pre-hearing order, the parties shall confer about settlement of some or all of the issues raised in this appeal. The parties shall file a Joint Statement within **60** days of the date of this pre-hearing order, **October 13, 2026**, certifying that they have conferred about settlement.
5. ***Board Conference Call*** - Within **120** days of the date of this pre-hearing order, the Board shall hold a conference call with the parties to discuss, among other things, pre-hearing deadlines, the likelihood of settlement, and whether an expedited hearing may be appropriate.

The Board may waive the conference call at its discretion.

6. ***Discovery*** - Discovery in proceedings before the Board is governed by the Pennsylvania Rules of Civil Procedure unless otherwise provided in the Board's Rules. Unless otherwise ordered by the Board, **discovery**, including the exchange of expert reports, if any, shall be *completed* within **180** days of the date of this pre-hearing order, **February 10, 2027**, unless extended for good cause upon written motion. 25 Pa. Code § 1021.101(a). All written discovery must be *served* no later than **30** days prior to the end of discovery, **January 11, 2027**, unless extended for good cause upon written motion. If the parties wish to propose an alternate schedule for discovery, they should refer to paragraph 8. Subpoenas for discovery purposes may be served in accordance with the Pennsylvania Rules of Civil Procedure. The service of an expert report together with a statement of qualifications may be substituted for answers to expert interrogatories. Expert discovery shall be governed by Pa. R.C.P. 4003.5.
7. ***Dispositive Motions*** - Unless otherwise ordered by the Board, **dispositive motions** shall be filed within **210** days of the date of this pre-hearing order, **March 12, 2027**. The motions shall comply with the Board's rules on dispositive motions at 25 Pa. Code §§ 1021.94 and 1021.94a. If the parties wish to propose an alternate schedule for the filing of dispositive motions, they should refer to paragraph 8.
8. ***Alternate Case Management Schedule*** - If the parties wish to propose an alternate schedule to the one set forth in paragraphs 6 and 7, they may file a joint motion for an Alternate Case Management Schedule which shall include a Joint Proposed Case Management Order setting forth alternate dates for the conclusion of discovery, the filing of dispositive motions and any other matters addressed in the motion. If the parties wish to have a separate deadline for the filing of expert reports, they may request it as part of the Joint Proposed Case Management Order. At any time, parties may also submit a motion for an expedited hearing pursuant to 25 Pa. Code §§ 1021.96a – 1021.96d.
9. ***Requests for Continuance or Extension*** - Any request for continuance, or for extending any filing deadline, must be made as a formal motion, pursuant to 25 Pa. Code § 1021.92, except when an opposing party consents to the continuance or extension. When there is such consent, the request may be embodied in an informal letter, provided the letter indicates the consent of the opposing party or parties. Requests for extensions or continuances and the accompanying proposed order, whether in letter or motion form, shall contain a specific date for the extension or continuance.
10. ***Response to Petition or Motion*** - Any party desiring to respond to a petition or motion must do so within the time set forth in 25 Pa. Code §§ 1021.91 – 1021.95, unless otherwise ordered. A party will be deemed to have waived the right to contest any motion or petition to which a timely response has not been filed. The Board will not notify the parties that a response may be due.

ELECTRONIC DISCOVERY

11. ***Conference as to Electronic Discovery*** - Within **45** days of the date of this pre-hearing order, all parties shall confer and discuss whether the parties believe discovery of electronically stored information (ESI) requires an ESI plan as set forth in paragraph 12. This discussion may take place during the conference regarding settlement required by paragraph 4.
12. ***Report to Board Regarding ESI Plan*** - If the parties agree that an ESI plan is necessary, within **60** days of the date of this pre-hearing order, the parties shall submit to the Board for its consideration a proposed plan for conducting electronic discovery along with a proposed order. The proposed plan shall address the following:
 - (a) any issues relating to preservation of discoverable information;
 - (b) the form in which the information will be produced;
 - (c) the period within which the information will be produced;
 - (d) the method for asserting or preserving claims of privilege or of protection of the information as trial-preparation materials, including whether such claims may be asserted after production;
 - (e) the method for asserting or preserving confidentiality and proprietary status of information relating to a party or a person not a party to the proceeding;
 - (f) whether allocation among the parties of the expense of production is appropriate;
 - (g) the position of each party as to any issue about which they are unable to agree; and,
 - (h) any other issue relating to the discovery of electronically stored information.
13. ***Board Order Regarding ESI Plan*** - The Board will issue an order governing the discovery of electronically stored information upon consideration of the parties' proposed plan and order submitted pursuant to paragraph 12. The Board may also issue an order upon its own motion or the motion of any party.
14. ***Electronic Filing*** - Except as set forth in 25 Pa. Code § 1021.32 or otherwise provided by the Board, documents filed in this matter shall be filed electronically unless excused by order of the Board. Attorneys not already registered for electronic filing must do so at the Board's website at: <https://efiling.ehb.pa.gov>. Individuals representing themselves are also encouraged to register for electronic filing. All parties registered with the Board's electronic filing system will only receive copies of the Board's orders, opinions, and adjudications electronically and will not be mailed hard copies of those documents.
15. ***Further Assistance*** - Anyone who encounters problems registering or filing a document electronically should contact the Board's staff at (717) 787-3483.



ENVIRONMENTAL HEARING BOARD

s/ Steven C. Beckman
STEVEN C. BECKMAN
Chief Judge and Chairperson

DATED: August 14, 2026

c: For the Commonwealth of PA, DEP:
Attention: Cassandra Lehn
(via *electronic mail*)

For Appellant:
William J. Cluck, Esquire
(via *electronic filing system*)

For Conservation District:
Cumberland County Conservation District
310 Allen Road
Suite 301
Carlisle, PA 17013
(via *first class U.S. mail*)

For Permittee:
Carlisle Development Partners, LLC
1660 International Drive
Ste 500
McLean, VA 22102
(via *first class U.S. mail*)

